Journal of Education Method and Learning Strategy E-ISSN 2986-9129 E-ISSN 3031-9250 Volume 2 Issue 03, September 2024, Pp. 988-1001 DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.59653/jemls.v2i03.985</u> Copyright by Author

Application of Governance Principles in Faculties of Education of Arab Universities: Requirements and Aspirations

Bannaga Taha Al-Zubair Hussen¹ 🝺, Saifaldin Idris Onia^{2*} 🝺

Department of Foundations of Education & Educational Administration, Faculty of Education, University of Khartoum, Sudan¹ Department of Foundations of Education & Educational Administration, Faculty of Education, University of Khartoum, Sudan² Corresponding e-mail: saifonia89@gmail.com*

Received: 05-06-2024 Reviewed: 20-06-2024 Accepted: 05-07-2024

Abstract

Governance of higher education institutions covers many areas including human resource management, funding, and education quality as well as assurance internationalization, academic and scientific planning that enhances transparency, accountability and participation. Therefore, this study aimed to identify the requirements for applying the principles of governance in the faculties of education at Arab universities. The study followed the qualitative and interpretive method, as well as analyzing the content of previous studies related to the study. The study reached that the faculties of education in Arab universities actually apply to a moderate degree the principles of governance in their management, as well as self-monitoring, development and sustainability. The study recommends that faculties of education should issuing regulations and legislation regarding standards and principles of governance in faculties of education in Arab universities, and obligating departments and councils to work with them. Besides, establishing independent committees within the faculties of education to follow up and evaluate the application of governance principles.

Keywords: Governance principles, Faculties of Education, Arab Universities, Requirements, Aspirations

Introduction

Governance has become an integrated framework of pillars and standards that aims to be adopted to create an institution that enhances transparency, accountability and participation, and in which the distribution of tasks and responsibilities among the administrative bodies legally responsible for managing the institution is balanced, with a role for stakeholders (beneficiaries) in the administrative process (Al-Qasim & Abu Bishara, 2019). Hence, the

governance of university education means the way in which its activities are directed, managed and monitored through formal and informal arrangements that allow colleges and universities to make decisions and take actions that achieve objectives and discuss outstanding issues of interest to individuals within and outside higher education institutions (Abdul Hakim, 2011).

Higher education institutions are considered makers of knowledge as they produce and direct it for progress, and cooperate with their partners in making the most of this knowledge, exchanging with them visions, benefiting from them, as they are partners in knowledge, development and destiny. The faculties of education in Arab universities are among the important institutions that contribute in most countries of the world to development in its various aspects, social, economic, administrative, political, health and others. It must have a wise, modern management that depends on several approaches, and one of the most important of these modern approaches to management is the approach to governance, which is the approach that has attracted the attention of researchers, and was addressed by pens in the economic, political and developmental fields (Al-Hamoud, 2021).

Despite the development and progress in the educational fields witnessed by universities in general and faculties of education in particular, these developments did not liberate the traditional grip and administrative routine associated with the centralization of decisions; Most departments of education faculties in Arab universities still ignore this, as many Arab universities suffer in some of their laws and legislation from the centralization of decision within an atmosphere characterized by some deficiencies in integrity, transparency and accountability, which may reflect negatively on their performance, and may constitute an obstacle to their development, especially in light of the competition they are witnessing (Anab, 2021). In this regard, many conferences were held, such as the Conference on Governance of Arab Universities in Amman (2016), which was one of its most important recommendations was to expedite the application of governance standards and its fields in Arab universities (Al-Rawdan, 2021).

Perhaps what prompts and encourages an increase in interest in activating governance in the colleges of education in Arab universities is the result of many studies on the positive impact of university governance, including the findings of the Alaklabi study (2019) about the existence of a relationship between the governance of colleges of education in Arab universities, and strategic vigilance. In addition, Mugabla study (2016), which revealed the existence of a relationship between administrative governance and job performance. Moreover, the study of Al-Zahrani (2012), which indicated that there is a relationship between good governance in faculties of education in Arab universities and job satisfaction and organizational loyalty among faculty members.

Based on the foregoing, it is clear that the application of governance in the faculties of education in Arab universities needs awareness and awareness of its concept and the mechanism of its application, which increases the desire to get close to its reality, and try to reach solutions and suggestions that increase its activation. Hence, this research sought to answer the following questions: what is the extent of the application of governance principles

in the faculties of education in Arab universities? What are the possible suggestions for applying governance principles in faculties of education in Arab universities?

Literature Review

Several studies have varied on determining the level of governance in universities; such as Al-Ramthi study (2019), indicated that the reality of applying governance in faculties of education in Arab universities is weak, which necessitates the necessity of educating about governance, ways to activate it, and limiting the obstacles to its application. Al-Mufaiz (2018) believed that in his study after its results showed that the level of activation of the areas of governance in the faculties of education in Arab universities was average, to highlight some of the obstacles that could prevent its implementation, including centralization, weak financial and administrative independence, and low level of academic freedom. In addition, the study of Al-Aklabi (2019) & Asiri (2017) indicated that the level of governance application was medium in some faculties of education in Arab universities. Al-Shammari (2018) & Al-Fawzan (2017) assured that neglecting to activate the standards of governance in the faculties of education in Arab universities.

Research method

The nature of this study is purely qualitative and interpretive (analytical) type of research where selected papers are reviewed. Abdullah (2011) defines it as a way to study scientific phenomena or problems by describing it in a scientific way, and then coming to at logical explanations that have evidence and proofs that give the researcher the ability to develop specific frameworks for the problem, and this is used in determining the results of the study. Analytical research is a specific type of research that involves critical thinking skills and the evaluation of facts and information relative to the research being conducted. The selected papers to be reviewed are gathered through extensive literature review from academic papers representing an output of previous studies conducted by various researches concerning governance application within higher education institutions.

Collecting data for this paper are gathered from previous studies, papers and researches concerning governance application, especially those related to higher education institutions. These studies have been published in relevant websites over the Internet, which include scientific publications, periodicals, studies, scientific research.

Data analysis for this paper is conducted based on the content analysis by using some elements gathered within the governance application in the higher education institutions such as; concept of governance, objectives of governance; and requirements and suggestions of applying governance and details are discussed below.

Findings and Discussion

The concept of governance

Governance is one of the most prominent concepts that have been raised at the academic level of management. It includes the transition from government administration in its traditional sense to a new situation that combines the forces of society, including governance, civil society organizations, and the private sector (Kentab, 2018). Gawdat (2008) defines it as a comprehensive system that compromises the measures of effective management performance and indicators of control methods that prevent any internal or external party from adversely affecting the activities of the institution and thereby ensuring the optimal use of the available resources to serve all parties interests evenly. Ghader (2012) perceives it as a set of procedures and processes through which organizations are guided and controlled, establishing a framework that guarantees the identification of rights and distribution and responsibilities among stakeholders, board of directors, shareholders and other contributors.

The concept of university governance emerged to express the real crisis that universities are going through and the proposed solutions to it, a crisis that is represented in the fact that there are university administrations placed by the executive authority above students and faculty members, whose task is to make decisions related to their affairs. Governance encompasses all of the good and bad ways in which societies distribute power and manage public resource, i.e. governance is the way power is wielded (Mehraj, 2020). A report by the European Network of Education Councils (2016), states that the governance of education is particularly complex and multifaceted because it occurs at various levels and the schools as a socio cultural community are under siege for a variety of reasons such as increased societal expectations.

Governance of higher education institutions covers many areas including human resource management, funding, and education quality as well as assurance internationalization, academic and scientific planning (Delgado .2012). Bourne and Peterkin (2017), argue that however, the governments are increasingly confronted with the challenge of funding higher education institutions due to the declining resources and increased responsibilities, the higher education institutions leaders should work in an open system within the context of the society or culture by having ultimate responsibility to the society in charge of and the objectives must be aligned with the demands of the larger social context.

Therefore, governance covers the structure and processes of decision-making groups, both formal and informal, and hence the relationships within and between these groups and individuals. (Jaradat, N., 2013). It is also a "set of activities, processes, and procedures at the university-wide level, linked together through a network of laws, policies and persons. It organizes and directs the interrelationship between many stakeholders who exchange interest and influence with the University administration, through a comprehensive and complex oversight system that Influences the way the university is directed, managed and controlled "(Nasser Al-Din, 2012).

Objectives of applying governance in faculties of education

Governance has a great importance in faculties of education, because it provides the organizational structure through which the goals of the college can be achieved. Al-Qasim & Abu Bishara (2019) identified its importance as follows: contributing to the creation of independent colleges of education that have governing councils and bodies responsible for defining their strategic direction and ensuring the effectiveness of their management. Helping colleges of education to achieve their goals in the best possible way. It is useful in revealing shortcomings in performance and weak outputs. Ensuring a balance between long-term strategic responsibilities and short-term operational responsibilities. Governance helps enhance competitiveness and avoid administrative and financial corruption. Ensuring the resources of the faculties of education and their optimal investment. It guarantees the rights and interests of employees of the administrative and academic bodies without discrimination. Governance is a system of self-control and supervision, which leads to the safety of the legal application of legislation, and consequently to good management and guaranteeing the rights of employees.

Therefore, the objectives of implementing governance cannot be assigned to one party, but rather relate to many parties that seek goals and benefits as a result of strengthening governance applications in government agencies and various business organizations. Hallaw & Taha (2012) consider that among the most important of these objectives:

- 1. Enhancing the effectiveness of colleges of education, and increasing their internal and external efficiency by creating a work environment.
- 2. Laying down laws and rules that guide the leaders and administrations of faculties of education when assuming administrative work, in a way that guarantees democracy and justice for all concerned parties.
- 3. Enhancing the participation of all parties, including academic and administrative members, leaders, and students, in decision-making processes.
- 4. Achieving justice and equality among workers to obtain high performance from all categories.
- 5. Providing the right of accountability and accountability to all parties benefiting from the existence of these institutions.
- 6. Achieving transparency by working according to clear mechanisms and frameworks, enabling workers to fully practice their work, and helping them to give more.
- 7. Active participation in all activities inside and outside the faculties of education.

Principles of Governance in Faculties of Education

Due to the increasing interest in the present era in the concept of governance, many organizations, bodies and community institutions with their various activities have studied and analyzed the concept, and set specific criteria for its application. In this study, the most important principles of governance of colleges of education will be reviewed. Those principles, their adoption and their observance in their executive and administrative policies, will be presented The principles of governance in faculties of education have been defined as follows: Hamad (2020) & Dahshan (2020):

- 1. Equality: It includes moving away from discrimination and prejudice among members of faculties of education, as well as among executive departments and leaders, and dealing with the principle of justice for all.
- 2. Maintaining the rights of the members of the Higher Council of faculties of Education: It is summarized in allowing the members of the College Council to express their opinions, giving them opportunities to participate and discuss, and accepting their proposals, with the development of financial and administrative rewards and incentives to motivate them on an ongoing basis.
- 3. Ensuring the rights of stakeholders: Stakeholders mean the group benefiting from the existence of colleges of education, and their rights can be preserved through sincerity and seriousness in setting and implementing educational policies, and feeding students with science and knowledge, to graduate qualified forces capable of that includes monitoring the fulfillment of responsibilities for all administrative areas such as risk management, financial review, and supervision of the methods used to evaluate the performance of students, administrative and academic staff, (Enab, 2021).
- 4. Transparency: Its importance lies in reducing ambiguity and eliminating the ambiguities of legislation, the growth of work with high quality standards, the interdependence between different organizations, and the development of administrative units (Al-Hattani, 2019). It also includes disclosing the educational, scientific, and executive policies of the faculties of education, expressing opinions and ideas, and cooperation and coordination among members of the same educational institution (Hamad, 2020).
- 5. Independence: It is a concept that means the freedom of universities and granting them autonomy, to become more responsive to social and economic environments, and more able to adapt to change and innovation. The university's independence has a multidimensional character. These are the administrative independence, financial independence and academic independence of universities (Al-Ghazali, 2018).

Requirements of applying governance in faculties of education at Arab Universities

The application of governance in faculties of education passes through specific stages, which are (Al-Qasim & Abu Bishara, 2019):

- 1. Introducing corporate governance: It is the first and most important stage of governance, in which a distinction is made between governance as a culture and as an administrative style that is adhered to, where the nature, approach, importance, tools and means of governance are clarified.
- 2. Building the infrastructure for governance: Corporate governance needs a solid infrastructure, capable of interacting with developments and surrounding variables.
- 3. Work of a standard program for governance: governance needs a specific timetable for tasks, so that the progress in implementing governance in the university institution can be monitored, and the obstacles and difficulties that hindered the implementation stage can be identified and evaluated.
- 4. Implementation stage: It is the stage of measuring the willingness and desire of the beneficiaries to implement governance, as implementation requires a number of practices

such as independence of authority, transparency, accountability, responsibility, equality, and studying and analyzing them to identify weaknesses in implementation.

5. Follow-up and development phase: It is carried out with the aim of ensuring good implementation, through internal and external oversight and reviews, and scrutiny of the mechanism for implementing administrative procedures and processes.

Status of Applying Governance in Faculties of Education at Arab Universities

Many Arab studies dealt with the reality of applying governance in faculties of education. Hence, the researchers reviewed studies closely related to the topic of the current study. Annab (2021) aimed to measure the degree of application of e-governance and its relationship to the degree of practice of administrative empowerment in Jordanian public universities from the point of view of faculty members, He used the quantitative methodology, and the results of the study showed that the degree of application of e-governance and the practice of administrative empowerment among faculty members in Jordanian public universities from their point of view was average.

Al-Hamoud (2021) aimed to identify the degree of governance application and its relationship to organizational excellence In Jordanian private universities in the capital governorate, Amman, from the point of view of the faculty members. The descriptive survey method was used. The results also indicated that there were differences between the average estimates of the sample members of the degree of governance application due to the difference in the gender variable in favor of males, and the difference in the academic rank variable in favor of the professor's rank.

Al-Rawdan (2021) sought to identify the level of governance of the College of Education at Qassim University in the light of the Kingdom's vision 2030 from the point of view of the faculty members. The descriptive survey method was used. The results of the study concluded that the level of governance activation in the College of Education at Qassim University came to a good degree, which is below high, and there are differences between the sample response due to gender and it was in favor of males.

Abu Qattam, & Al-Zaboun & Al-Qamuz (2020) conducted study to know the degree of application of governance at the University of Jordan from the point of view of academics. The study used the descriptive analytical approach, and the results of the study showed that the reality of the application of governance at University of Jordan appeared to a medium degree, in addition to the absence of statistically significant differences between the average estimates of the sample members due to the study's categorical variables (sex, rank, years of experience, type of college) and when all fields except for the type of college, as it was found that there is statistical significant difference between the science and humanities faculties and in favor of the humanities faculties.

Hamad (2020) aimed to study the reality of the application of governance at Jerash University and the viewpoint of the faculty members. The study relied on the descriptive analytical approach, and the study concluded that the reality of applying Governance at University of Jerash is medium, in addition to the absence of statistically significant differences in the averages the estimations of the sample members in the degree of application of

governance at Jerash University due to the categorical study variables in all fields except for the college variable.

Al-Dahshan (2020) aimed to develop a proposed vision for the requirements of applying e-governance at Assiut University in the light of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, and the conceptual framework for e-governance. The study relied on the descriptive approach to get to know the opinions of faculty members in some faculties of Assiut University about the reality of application and the obstacles that prevent its good application.

Al-Zuhairi & Al-Quraishi (2020) aimed to know the role of the components of strategic planning in implementing e-governance at Wasit University in Iraq. The descriptive correlative approach was used, and the results of the study showed that the mathematical average from the university's vision was (1.91), meaning that it is partially available, and the gap between what is available and what is required to be reached is (54%), which is a large gap that needs appropriate strategies to address it. Moreover, the mathematical average of the university's mission reached (1.88), meaning that it is partially available, and the gap between what is available and what is required to be reached is (55%), which is a large gap that needs appropriate strategies to address it.

Miqdadi & Ibrahim (2020) aimed to identify the administrative performance of the heads of academic departments in Jordanian universities and its relationship to the application of governance principles. The questionnaire was used as a tool for the study to collect data through the application of the descriptive survey method, and the most prominent results of the study showed that the degree of application of the principles of governance in Jordanian universities was at a medium degree, and the results indicated that there were statistically significant differences due to the variables (university, type of college, years of experience for the degree of The application of governance, and the absence of statistically significant differences due to the variables (gender, age, academic rank).

Mthethwa & Chikoko (2020) aimed to identify the academic value of the university's participation in the field of governance, the study used the qualitative research method to understand the relationship between participation in university governance and academic experiences, and the study concluded that the academic value of the university's participation in governance is affected by several political factors, The level of study, the ability to balance time, and participation in governance add academic value to the university.

Muhsin et al. (2020) identified the relationship between governance and quality of teaching on student satisfaction, as well as study the impact of learning facilities on university governance and student satisfaction, and notes the use of the descriptive approach (relational), so that the results concluded that governance, quality of teaching and learning facilities had a positive impact. On student satisfaction, the quality of teaching is affected by the governance of the university, in addition to the fact that learning facilities have a significant role and impact on university governance.

Al-Qahtani (2019) aimed to identify the level of application of university governance at Imam Muhammad bin Saud Islamic University to achieve competitive advantage in light of the vision of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (2030). The study relied on the descriptive analytical approach, and the most prominent results of the study showed that the degree of applying governance to achieve competitive advantage in decision-making at Imam Muhammad bin Saud Islamic University was high, and the level of competitive advantage in decision-making was also high.

Al-Qasim & Abu Bishara (2019) aimed to identify the extent to which the principles of governance are applied in the faculties and departments of physical education in Palestinian higher education institutions from the point of view of current and former officials. The results indicated that the extent to which the principles of governance are applied in the faculties and departments of physical education in the Palestinian higher education institutions was significant in all axes and the total degree, as the average axis of implementation of transparency was (3.97), while the axis of participation and the axis of accountability were, respectively (3.75), (3.51).

Al-Hadabi & Al-Azizi Study (2019) The study aimed to identify the level of activating the principles of governance in Yemeni universities, using the descriptive survey method. The results came by determining the sample members' assessment of the level of application of governance principles at Sana'a University with a low degree, and the field of justice was in the first place, and the field of participation in the last place. The degree of appreciation of the sample members to the level of application of governance principles at the University of Science and Technology was determined with a high general estimation, where the field of responsibility ranked first, and the field of participation ranked last.

Salahudin et al. (2019) aimed to design a model of university governance with integrity that focuses on the basic operations of universities, using a qualitative research method. Universities do not activate the principle of integrity in the core of their work and functions represented in: (teaching, scientific research, community service, human resources, budget, infrastructure, leadership), in addition to the spread of corruption practices in university administrations.

Al-Ramthi (2019) aimed to identify the development of institutional performance at the University of Bisha in the light of the most prominent global systems of university governance, by following the descriptive survey method. The results of the study revealed that the level of Saudi university administrations is weak, which may negatively affect their outputs and their ability to achieve their strategic goals. It also proved that the application of governance has an effective impact on developing their institutional performance, raising the level of its quality, and supporting its strategic plans. The level of governance application at the University of Bisha was generally average.

Sayidah et al. (2019) aimed to analyze the importance of quality and university governance in Indonesia, using the qualitative research method, and the results of the study indicated that university governance declines if its cadres are unqualified. The university represented by students, and this demonstrates the critical importance of governance in the management of universities and their outputs.

Salmi (2019) aimed to identify a review of academic and leadership governance at the governmental and private levels, where the results of the study revealed changes regarding governance mechanisms in higher education in response to the need for more decentralization and compatibility with state policies. Increasing the autonomy of higher education institutions has been one of the major achievements, but more attention is needed with regard to accountability mechanisms.

Hamada (2019) aimed to identify the position of the Japanese teaching profession on reforms to school governance, and the difficulties teachers face with the progress of these reforms. The experience in the teaching profession is based on a mixture of academic and practical, the term (educational professionals) should be interpreted as including researchers, and practitioners. The governance mechanism for teaching should be built through a four-way relationship between researchers, practitioners, citizens, and the government.

Aspirations of applying governance in faculties of education

This study shed light on the one of the modern administrative concepts in the field of education, which is "governance", as this concept is relatively recent, so subjecting it to the field study gives it a clear importance, especially in light of the circumstances and changes taking place in the faculties of education in Arab universities. Governance in universities is responsible for helping tertiary education institutions to respond to other criteria in terms of accomplishing qualitative education outputs and performing their mission and vision competently and efficiently. Therefore, there is need to adopt this concept in the university level.

Areiqat, Zamil, Fathi, Ahmad, & Abushaar. (2020) address the governance aspect of universities in light of its importance in recent years in the global and local arena. There is now a definite need to enhance the competitive capacities, learning outputs and education quality of universities. The paper highlights the role of universities in governance, which are essential to achieve the basis and criteria of governance like greater transparency, participation, trust, reliability, and accountability. These aspects could help university administrators to play their role in addressing the challenges faced by them in the twenty-first century.

Wuriyanti, Utami, & Sentanu (2020) stated that principles of Good University Governance become a value and the best choice for universities as a basis for intense competition to become a leading tertiary institution in world-class universities. They indicated that the procurement of Human Resources in university need to use the principles of Good University Governance, transparency, accountability, responsibility, fairness, and independence in the recruitment process of teaching staff and education staff, selection of teaching staff and education staff, placement in assignments and positions that are accordingly, training and development, preparation of career paths, up to discipline enforcement and awarding.

Therefore, this study aspire to adopt the governance principles in faculties of education at Arab Universities. To do that it is necessary to strengthening the role of the Union of Arab Universities, and consolidating the bonds of partnership between it and the faculties of education. Establishing an association of faculties of education in Arab universities, to activate the principles of transparency, participation, and accountability more broadly. Work to increase awareness of the concept of governance and its principles, through holding educational sessions and meetings. Providing effective and multiple means of communication between the college administration and all officials, in a manner that ensures easy dissemination of laws and regulations. Activating the role of the internal and external audit and control committees, and assisting them in creating the appropriate conditions to carry out their work.

Furthermore, separating the work of the administrative departments from each other, and trying not to duplicate them as much as possible, so that it makes it easier for the college administration to determine the defect place, and who is responsible for it. Adopting a performance appraisal method that includes the participation of all parties (administrative body, academic staff, students, officials, and observers), in the light of which weaknesses are addressed and points of strengths are strengthened. Adopting an approach that enables the participation of the concerned parties in decision-making by forming committees and councils that include a number of members representing them.

Conclusion

In the light of the researchers' analysis of the theoretical literature and previous studies, the faculties of education in Arab universities actually apply the principles of governance in their administration, which were under other names such as academic quality. Some faculties of education have institutions of self-monitoring, development and sustainability.

Based on what stated the following recommendations could be made which help in applying the principles of governance in the faculties of education in Arab universities. Hence, faculties of education should issuing regulations and legislation regarding standards and principles of governance in faculties of education in Arab universities, and obligating departments and councils to work with them. In addition to, establishing independent committees within the colleges of education to follow up and evaluate the implementation of governance principles. Besides, adoption of unified and declared principles and standards for the various faculties of education in Arab universities.

References

- Abdul Hakim, Farouk Jafar. (2011). University Governance, Introduction to the development of management through participation. *Journal of Educational Sciences*, first issue, pp. 315-326.
- Abdullah, A. (2011). Scientific Research Methodology and Writing University Theses, Dar Al-Tawheed. Amman. Jordan.
- Abu- Qattam, F. & Al Zboon, S. & Al Ghammaz, S. (2020). The Reality of Applying Governance at the University of Jordan: An academic's perspective, *I U G Journal of Educational & Psychological Studies*, 28. (3), pp. 772-797.

- Al- Dahshan, J. (2020). A proposed conception of the requirements for applying e-governance at Assiut University in Light of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. *The Educational Journal*, 12(4), pp. 58-93
- Al-Aklabi, A. (2019). The relationship between strategic vigilance and the governance of Saudi universities according to the contents of the vision of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia 2030, an applied study on the University of Shaqra. *Shaqra University Journal*, 1 (12), pp. 1-36.
- Al-Fawzan, Al. (2017). A framework for activating the government in universities to achieve the vision of 2030. Conference research: *The role of Saudi universities in activating the vision of 2030:* Qassim University, Qassim: Qassim University, pp. 117-167.
- Al-Ghazali, M. (2018). The application of e-governance to the quality of higher education by focusing on the costs of quality "An analytical study of the opinions of a sample of workers at the University of Anbar. *Maghreb Journal of Economics and Administration*, 5(1), pp. 55-86.
- Al-Hadabi, D. & Al-Azizi, M. (2019). The level of application of governance principles in Yemeni universities: a comparative study between private and public universities. *The Arab Journal for Quality Assurance of University Education.* 12(39), pp. 31-62.
- Al-Hamoud, A. (2021). The degree of application of governance and its relationship to organizational excellence in Jordanian universities Private schools in the capital Amman governorate from the point of view of the faculty members (Master's thesis Unpublished) University of the Middle East, Amman, Jordan.
- Al-Mufaiz, Kh. (2018). Implementing governance in Saudi public universities: a proposed scenario. *Journal of Educational Sciences*. 1(15), pp. 199-286.
- Al-Qahtani, R. (2019). A framework for the governance of Saudi universities to achieve a competitive advantage in taking Decisions according to the aspirations of Vision (2030) *Journal of Educational and Psychological Sciences*, 15 (3), pp. 51-79.
- Al-Qasim, N. & Abu Beshara, J. (2019). The extent to which the principles of governance are applied in the faculties and departments of physical education in the Palestinian higher education institutions. *Journal of Educational Studies*, 46 (1), pp. 693-711.
- Al-Ramthi, S. and Eid, H. (2019). The most prominent global systems of university governance: Developing institutional performance at the University of Bisha in the light of a proposed model. *Journal of Educational*. *66*(*1*) pp. 1009-1069.
- Al-Roudan, R. (2021). The reality of the governance of the College of Education at Qassim University in the light of the Kingdom's vision (2030). *International Journal of Educational and Psychological Studies*, 9(2), pp. 653-673. DOI: https://doi.org/10.31559/EPS2021.9.2.18.
- Al-Shammari, A. (2018). Governance of Saudi universities and their role in achieving the Kingdom's vision 2030. *Journal of Educational Sciences*. *30*(*3*), pp. 369-397.
- Al-Zahrani, Kh. (2012). The reality of applying good governance in private Saudi universities and its relationship to job satisfaction and organizational loyalty to its faculty members. (Unpublished Ph.D. thesis). Umm Al Qura University.

- Al-Zuhairi, T. & Al-Quraishi F. (2020) Strategic planning and its role in localizing governance government in universities. *Wasit Journal of Human Sciences*, *14*(*41*), pp. 57-85.
- Annab, A. (2021). The reality of e-governance application in Jordanian public universities And its relationship to the administrative empowerment of faculty members from their point of view. (Unpublished Master's Thesis), Middle East University.
- Areiqat, A. Y., Zamil, A. M., Fathi, A., Ahmad, M. M., & Abushaar, H. M. (2020). The concept of governance in universities: reality and ambition. *International Journal of Innovation*, *Creativity and Change*, 13(1), 951-969.
- Asiri, Kh. and Al-Qahtani, M. (2017). The reality of the governance of Prince Sattam bin Abdulaziz University in the light of the vision of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia 2030 from the point of view of its administrative and academic leaders (unpublished master's thesis). Prince Sattam University.
- Bourne, P & Peterkin, V. (2017). Academic Leadership and Governance of Higher Education. International Journal of Research in Business Studies and Management, 4(9).
- Delgado, L. (2012). Good Governance in Higher Education. The Right to Education. *Research Gate*.
- Gawdat, F. A. (2008). Applying the principles of corporate governance in Palestinian banks according to the principles of OECD and Basel Committee on Banking Supervision (Master Thesis, Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine).
- Ghader, M. Y. (2012). Governance determinants and standards. Paper presented to the International Scientific Conference: Globalization of Management in an Era Knowledge, December, 15-17, 2012, Al-Jinan University, Tripoli, Lebanon.
- Halawa, J. & Taha., N. (2012). The reality of governance at Al-Quds University. Algerian Institutions Performance Journal, 1(2), pp. 81-96.
- Hamad, A. (2020). The reality of applying governance at Jerash University from the point of view of the members of the board Teaching", *Journal of Educational Sciences*, 47 (2) pp. 232-248.
- Hamada, H. (2019). Governance and Expertise in the Teaching Profession: An Analysis of Contemporary Japanese Educational Reforms. *ECNU Review of Education*, 2(2): 166-177.
- Jaradat, N. (2013). Strategic Management Modern Integrated Perspective. Mithra for publishing and distribution, Amman- Jordan.
- Kentab, M. Y. (2018). The Applicability of Governance at King Saud University in Riyadh. Universal Journal of Educational Research, 6(1), 25-41.
- Mehraj, T. (2020). Concept of Governance: An Overview. Research Gate.
- Miqdadi, B. & Ibrahim, A. B (2020). Administrative performance of department heads The Academy in Jordanian Universities and its Relationship to the Application of Governance Principles, *International Journal of Studies Educational and psychological*, 8(1), pp. 1-26.

- Mogabala, M. (2016). Administrative governance and its relationship to job performance at Taif University from the point of view of academic staff members. *Journal of the College of Education*, 16 (3), pp. 61-108.
- Mthethwa, V. & Chikoko, V. (2020). *Does Participation in University Governance Add Value to a Student's Academic Experience,* (Un published dissertation), Durban university of Technology, South Africa.
- Muhsin, S. & Nurkhin, A. & Pramusinto, H. & Afsari, N. & Arham, A. (2020). The Relationship of Good University Governance and Student Satisfaction. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 9(1), pp. 35-56, https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v9n1p1.
- Nasser Al-Dean, Yaqoub Adel. (2012). The reality of application of governance at the University of Middle East from the point of view of the members of the teaching and administrative staff. Amman, Middle East University.
- Salahudin, S. & Nurmandi, A. & Fajar, M. & Mutiarin, D. & Siregar, B. & Sulistyaningsih, T. & Karinda, K. (2019). Developing Integrity University Governance Model in Indonesia. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 8(5): pp. 185-199, https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v8n5p185.
- Sayidah, N. & Ady, S. & Supriyati, J. & Winedar, M. & Mulyaningtyas, A. & Assagaf, A. (2019). Quality and University Governance in Indonesia. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 8 (4), pp. 10-17.
- Wuriyanti, I., Utami, H. N., & Sentanu, I. G. E. P. S. (2020). Implementation of Good University Governance Principles in Procurement of Human Resources in Universitas Brawijaya. Wacana Journal of Social and Humanity Studies, 23(1).