Analysis of Public – Private Partnership Model in Cooperation and Management of Sembilan Gili Beach Tourism, Genting, Sumenep District

Dwi Listia Rika Tini¹*, Nur Inna Alfiyah²
Prodi Administrasi Publik Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Wiraraja, Indonesia¹
Prodi Administrasi Publik Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Wiraraja, Indonesia²
Corresponding Email: rikatini@wiraraja.ac.id*

Received: 17-02-2024 Reviewed: 25-02-2024 Accepted: 18-03-2024

Abstract

The aim of this research is to describe the Public – Private Partnership model or collaboration between the public sector and the private sector in collaborating and managing Sembilan Beach Tourism. The cooperation model or Public Private Partnership in this research looks in more detail at each type which is seen from several provisions, namely: Asset Ownership, Operations and Management, Capital Investment, Commercial Risk, Duration of Collaboration, Need for technical expertise and managerial expertise, Need for Efficiency Operations, Large financial investments, Need for Political Commitment, Determination of Service Tariffs, Regulatory Framework, Information. The results of this research show that the Bringsang Village Government uses the Public-Private Partnership model in collaborating with the private sector. The variant used as the basis for cooperation is the BOT or Build-Operate-Transfer model which contains the simple meaning that this cooperation is related to development, management and at a predetermined time the authority to provide these services will be returned to the government. However, the reality on the ground turns out that there are several conditions of this cooperation model that are not fulfilled or even exceed the capacity of one of the parties in the cooperation for the development, development and management of Pantai Sembilan Tourism. However, apart from some discrepancies and also some adjustments to the characteristics and offers that might be taken into consideration by both parties, what needs to be noted is that this cooperation model can now be said to have succeeded in achieving its initial objectives. Agreement.

Keywords: Sembilan Beach, Tourism Management, Public – Private Partnership
Introduction

Sembilan Beach, which is located in Bringsang Village, Gili Genting District, Sumenep Regency, is currently a favorite because every year there are more than 6,000 visitors who visit this tourist attraction so that the Sembilan Beach tourism sector has great potential as a source of regional income. (Hanifah & Fitriyah, 2021). It is proven from the PAD of Sumenep Regency from the tourism sector in 2018 Rp. 588,810,000, in 2019 Rp. 699,212,050, in 2020 there was a decrease due to the Covid-19 pandemic with total income of Rp. 350,000,000. Meanwhile, in 2021, the local revenue target for Sumenep district is IDR 575,000,000 (ElJabar, 2021). So there is a need for good cooperation between the government, the private sector and the community in developing tourist attractions. Therefore, public policy based on Public–Private Partnership can be used in tourism management as introduced by Mihai Leontescu & Egija Svilane, namely 1) Bringing benefits to society, fostering a national competitive climate, reducing risks for private and public entities and providing opportunities for technology diffusion. 2) building the effectiveness of government missions through private sector business technology, production efficiency, and reducing development costs. 3) stimulate innovation, competitiveness and reduce costs and risks for the private sector. 4) improving the regional economy through increasing new job opportunities, increasing production and profits (Leontescu & Svilane, 2012).

The economic improvement resulting from the management of the Sembilan Beach area has received the attention of the local government. This is proven by including Sembilan Beach on the list of tourist destinations to visit Sumenep 2018, while the involvement of private parties here includes PT. Santos who built the prayer room and 4 (four) bathroom units, PT. BRI built 2 kiosks for the food court as well as the words Sembilan Beach which became Tourism Icon. Meanwhile, community participation was shown starting from the available transportation to tourist locations and several tour guides. (Malia & Hanafi, 2018), However, there is no one from Bringsang village itself who has become a tour guide, the majority of tour guides come from other villages.

However, the management of the Sembilan Beach tourism with Public Private Partnership policies in order to improve the quality of the Sembilan Beach tourism services brings other problems, especially for the local community. Other problems that arise as a form of negative externality include additional costs that must be borne by the community (tourists), such as expensive ticket prices, especially for Sundays and national holidays, the community has not directly experienced the distribution of benefits from the management of Sembilan Beach involving the private sector, and has not yet been seen new job opportunities for local people.

Referring to the research problem, there are two important questions that can be formulated, namely how the Public Private Partnership will manage Sembilan Beach and what the Public Private Partnership model will be like in managing. Various studies on Public Private Partnerships have been carried out, including Gwyndaf Williams who said that the success of partnerships in the renewal process of Manchester City Center (Williams, 2006). Likewise, Muraviev, Nikolai, Kakabadse said that there is conflict/conflict and overlap between private and public in contracts and institutions. (Mouraviev & Kakabadse NK, 2012). Partnerships have also created new opportunities for the private sector to exercise power and influence over
domains that previously preserved public sector organizations, for example, in establishing norms and standards on issues in specific areas such as the emergence of new forms of global health governance, for example in Global fund for AIDS, malaria and tuberculosis, where the commercial sector is represented (Buse & Harmer A, 2004).

From these various studies, of course there are many types of cooperation models that can be implemented to implement Public Private Partnerships. However, in this research, the cooperation model or Public Private Partnership carried out by the Regional Government of Sumenep Regency with the private sector in the development and management of Sembilan Beach Tourism looks in more detail at each The type is seen from several provisions, namely:

1. Asset Ownership
2. Operations and Management
3. Capital investment
4. Commercial Risk
5. Duration of Collaboration
6. The need for technical expertise and managerial expertise.
7. The need for operational efficiency
8. Large investment
9. The Need for Political Commitment
10. Determination of Service Fees
11. Regulatory Framework
12. Information

**Literature Review**

**Public - Private Partnership (PPP) Concept**

PPP is an arrangement between the government and the private sector to provide various types of public services, such as infrastructure development, provision of community facilities, and various other types of services. PPP is characterized by the sharing of investments, risks, responsibilities and rewards between the government and the private sector partners (Toyib & Nugroho, 2018).

The reasons behind the birth of this model are generally related to financing, design, construction, operationalization and maintenance of infrastructure services. With partnerships, the advantages of both the government and the private sector can be combined. The roles and responsibilities of partnerships can vary, it could be that the government has more of a role or vice versa, the private sector has more of a role in a form of partnership. However, a strong and effective government role is still needed in policy making. The
government remains the responsible and accountable party for ensuring the quality of public services.

In principle, in PPP, there are two actors involved, namely the government and the private sector. Both work together as partners, in this case neither party supervises the other party. In PPP there are shared goals based on commitments to be achieved, and based on commitments to own responsibilities. Each party provides input, which can be financial or other resources. Both parties are willing to bear the risks and share profits based on consideration of the input provided (share) in the agreement.

Types of Public Private Partnerships in Tourism Management

Types of Public Private Partnerships according to Kumar and Prasad (2004) (Kumar S, 2004) adalah:

a. Management Contract

Management Contract is an agreement in which the operational control of a company is authorized based on a contract by a different company where the company performs the necessary managerial functions in exchange for a fee. Management contracts involve not just offering a method of doing something (as with franchising or licensing), but actually being involved in doing it (Gunawan & Kencana, 2023). A management contract can involve various functions, such as technical operation of production facilities, personnel management, accounting, marketing services, training, etc.

b. Leases

A lease is an agreement between two parties, the lessor (the party renting out) and the lessee (the renter).

c. Concession BOT

The Build Operate Transfer (BOT) contract is a collaboration between the government and the private sector in building public infrastructure which aims to increase infrastructure growth without spending money from the government. Implemented in this contract, cooperation in which the private sector finances, designs, builds, operates and maintains infrastructure facilities within a certain concession period and ends with the handover of the facilities to the government without any compensation.

d. BOOT / BOO

The Build Own Operate Transfer contract is the granting of exclusive franchise rights to private developers to finance, build, operate, maintain, manage infrastructure facilities within a certain concession period and ends with the handover of the facilities to the government without any compensation.

More detailed differences between each type according to Kumar and Prasad (2004) in their article entitled Public – Private Partnership in urban infrastructure are described in the following tables:
### Tabel 1 Basic parameters of Public Private Partnership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opsi</th>
<th>Operational Asset</th>
<th>Operations and Management</th>
<th>Capital Investment</th>
<th>Commercial Risk</th>
<th>Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service Contract (Kontrak Pelayanan)</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>3-5 Tahun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Contract (Kontrak Manajemen)</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>3-5 Tahun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lease (Sewa)</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Bersama</td>
<td>8-15 Tahun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concession BOT (Konsesi BOT)</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>25-30 Tahun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOOT/BOO</td>
<td>Swasta / Publik</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>20-30 Tahun</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Sumber: Kumar dan Prasad, 2004*

a. Asset ownership
   Ownership of the assets in question is ownership of land, as well as buildings or structures used in infrastructure development.

b. Operations and Managerial
   Operations and Managerial include the implementation of services, management and maintenance of infrastructure including but not limited to marketing services.

c. Capital investment
   Capital investment is the provision of capital for construction, development and management of infrastructure.

d. Commercial Risk
   Commercial risks are all forms of risk that arise due to compelling circumstances.

e. Collaboration time period
   The time period is the period of cooperation in management or other matters in the agreement outside the development time period.

Meanwhile, to differentiate based on the extent of the role required by the public party towards the private party (private sector/cooperation partners) in cooperation is to compare it with the objectives of the cooperation through:

a) The need for technical expertise
   Technical expertise is knowledge and expertise in a particular field of specialization or expertise on how to do and produce something which consists of direction with
motivation, supervision and communication.
b) The need for managerial skills.
Managerial skills are skills related to goal setting, planning, organizing, preparing personnel and supervising.
c) Operation Efficiency
The efficiency in question is providing services or services to the community without using more resources.
d) Large capital investment (invest: in bulk).
The large capital investment funds referred to in this research are investment funds owned by the private sector as capital participation used for development.
e) Indirect investment.
Indirect investment means investment that is invested indirectly or investment that is made within a certain period for management and maintenance.

Each of these characteristics is differentiated as described in the following table:

Table 2 Options for mapping public sector expectations achieved by private participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sasaran Opsi</th>
<th>Keahlian Teknis</th>
<th>Keahlian Manajerial</th>
<th>Efisiensi Operasi</th>
<th>Investasi: Langsung</th>
<th>Investasi: Tidak Langsung</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service Contract (Kontrak Pelayanan)</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Contract (Kontrak Manajemen)</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lease (Sewa)</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
<td>Ya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concession BOT (Konsesi BOT)</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOOT/BOO</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Ya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Kumar dan Prasad, 2004*

Meanwhile, below are certain prerequisites for Public-Private Partnerships in developing and for sustainable success and the importance of prioritization of factors for various options as shown below along with the characteristics of each model:

a. Requires Political Commitment

Political commitment in this research means the involvement of BPD to provide commitment in supporting the collaboration process.

b. Determining Service Rates
Determining service rates is defined as the decision to provide prices or rates for providing services.

c. Regulatory Framework

The Regulatory Framework is a collaborative agreement that is designed, planned and produced which is embodied in a regulation.

d. Information

The information in this research is understood as the accountability of the management in carrying out collaboration.

**Tabel 3** Prioritization of prerequisite needs in the collaboration process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kebutuhan Opsi</th>
<th>Komitmen Politik</th>
<th>Tarif Pelayanan</th>
<th>Kerangka Peraturan</th>
<th>Informasi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service Contract (Kontrak Pelayanan)</td>
<td>Rendah</td>
<td>Rendah</td>
<td>Rendah</td>
<td>Rendah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Contract (Kontrak Manajemen)</td>
<td>Cukup</td>
<td>Cukup</td>
<td>Cukup</td>
<td>Rendah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lease (Sewa)</td>
<td>Cukup</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concession BOT (Konsesi BOT)</td>
<td>Cukup</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOOT/BOO</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Sumber: Kumar dan Prasad, 2004*

**Research Method**

In this research, researchers used qualitative methods. Qualitative research is related to efforts to explain social phenomena (Beverley H, 2002). Qualitative research is the most important way to find cause and effect (Maxwell JA, 2020). This research also uses various data collection methods such as interviews and observation. Interviews were conducted with the Head of DISBUDPARPORA Sumenep Regency, the Head of Bringsang village, Investors and several communities to collect data regarding their opinions about the possibility of collaborating in managing the Sembilan Beach tourism. Observations were carried out by directly documenting the nine beach tourist locations. Secondary data was obtained through literature studies, both reference books and accredited scientific journals.

**Result/Findings**

Public sector and private sector partnership at Sembilan Gili Genting Beach
Infrastructure development in the era of regional autonomy has become the full responsibility of the Regional Government. Regions that do not have sufficient financial resources to build them must look for the best alternatives to meet the needs of their people. One alternative that is often used is the use of a Public-Private Partnership cooperation pattern.

The main logic in establishing this collaboration is the unique characteristics possessed by the two sectors participating in the collaboration, namely the public sector and the private sector. This uniqueness can provide advantages for each sector to provide more specific aspects in providing services to the public (Zakki et al., 2023). Success in this collaboration depends on the strength and ability of each sector in building cooperation to complement each other. The rights and responsibilities of one sector may vary in each type of collaboration. For example, in one type of cooperation design, the private sector has quite significant involvement in all aspects of service delivery, in another type of cooperation, the private sector has an insignificant level of involvement (Sjaifurrachman & Fithry, 2024b).

The problem that often arises in Public-Private Partnerships is the culture of each organization, both government and private sector. Each organization will tend to act, in collaboration with other organizations, according to what they know (Fithry & Sjaifurrachman, 2024). The public sector will act as the public sector and the private sector will act as the private sector, so that even though the government and the private sector have long worked together, when the government buys a product from the private sector it will create a complex relationship. The government thinks that the private sector will take advantage of the government while the private sector thinks that the government considers too much and takes up too much time.

1. Asset Ownership

In Public Private Partnership: in urban infrastructure written by Kumar and Prasad (2004), asset ownership in public sector collaboration with the private sector is defined as ownership of land, as well as buildings or structures used in infrastructure development. In the collaboration with the Build Operate Transfer form by Kumar and Prasat, asset ownership is owned by the public sector.

Ownership of assets in the Pantai Sembilan area relates to land ownership, as well as buildings or structures used in the development and management of the Tourist Area. The ownership of the assets of Pantai Sembilan Tourism is owned by the Bringsang Village Government and the Main Investor, namely Mr. Sutlan, this is in accordance with the results of the researcher's interview with Mr. Sutlan as the main investor, at the Pantai Sembilan tourist attraction on October 28 2023:

"Pantai Sembilan is the result of collaboration between the Bringsang Village Government and myself. Initially, Sembilan Beach was famous for its white sand beach among the local community, but I was moved to develop this Sembilan Beach tourism, because I only had 20% of the assets and the village 80%, so I collaborated with the village in managing the Sembilan Beach tourism. "Even though the land used for the Pantai Sembilan tourist area is mostly owned by the Bringsang village government, however,
management and development is carried out by a business entity created jointly by the village government and me."

So even though the management and development is carried out by a business entity formed by the Bringsang Village government with the main investor, namely Mr. Sutlan, the business entity still has an obligation to pay land rent to the Bringsang Village Government. This is stated in the cooperation agreement (MoU) Investor Obligations:

"Provide land rental payments of Rp. 25,000,000,- (Twenty five million rupiah) every year which will be paid after the inauguration and reviewed every 5 (five) years."

Apart from land, asset ownership also includes buildings and other infrastructure in the Sembilan Beach Tourism Area. The buildings and other infrastructure in the Pantai Sembilan Tourism Area are jointly owned by the Bringsang Village Government and Mr. Sutlan through a jointly created business entity. So in management, business entities that are in a cooperation agreement must pay land rent to the Bringsang village government, as explained in the interview with Mr. Sutlan.

Meanwhile, assets in the form of buildings and other infrastructure in the Sembilan Beach Tourism Area are one part of the infrastructure development for the establishment of the Sembilan Beach Tourism Area. Apart from that, there are several companies that are investors in infrastructure, namely PT. Santos built the prayer room, 4 (four) bathroom units and 4 gazebos. Meanwhile PT. BRI built 2 kiosks for the food court as well as the words Pantai 9 which became the Beach 9 Tourism Icon and 2 accommodation units.
The division of ownership of assets relating to buildings and infrastructure within them is determined by the amount of shares (capital) invested by each party. The distribution of capital for construction, development and management of tourist areas in phase I is 70% is the responsibility of the Bringsang Village Government and the remaining 30% is the obligation to provide capital. In the MoU it is stated that the first party (Pemdes Bringsang) is obliged to provide capital for the construction, development and management of tourist areas amounting to 70% (seventy percent) of the needs. Then for phase II, according to what is stated in the addendum to the cooperation agreement, the obligation of the first party (Pemdes Bringang) in providing development capital is 45% (forty five percent) and 55% (fifty five percent) of the remaining capital is the obligation of the investor, namely Mr. Sultan.
2. Operations and Managerial

Operational and managerial is the implementation of services, management and maintenance of infrastructure including but not limited to marketing services. In Public Private Partnership: in urban infrastructure, the management, maintenance and operation of the cooperation object is the responsibility of the private sector. The role of Operation and Maintenance is delegated to the private sector completely from the public sector (Kurniawati et al., 2023).

In the management, maintenance and implementation of services at Sembilan Beach Tourism, it is managed by a jointly formed company, namely CV Sejahtera Sejati, where this business entity is assisted directly technically and administratively by Mr. Sutlan himself. The district government cannot manage tourism because it does not have technical expertise in tourism management. Apart from that, the expertise possessed by the government usually involves managerial expertise in the field of public services. It's different if it is managed by the private sector, jobs from the highest level (manager) to the lowest level, have professionalism in their respective fields, clear job descriptions and job specifications. Their work will always be under supervision so that the quality of the service is maintained. It doesn't matter what level the position is at.

So in the management of the joint venture there is one of the Bringsang village government employees who is placed in one of the ranks. Its function is as a supervisor in the management of the business entity (CV Sejahtera Sejati). His duties are not only as financial supervisor, but also as overall supervisor in management. Apart from that, the appointment of one of the Bringang village government employees to function as a representative of CV Sejahtera Sejati stockholders as a party involved in decision making for policy considerations that will be carried out in the managerial ranks.

3. Capital Investment

Capital investment, which has been briefly touched on in the sub-chapter on asset ownership, is referred to in this research as providing capital for development and infrastructure management. So capital investment also relates to business capital in the form of fresh funds or cash as funds used for construction and development purposes.

It has been previously explained in the asset ownership sub-chapter that the amount of shares owned by the village government in phase I is 70% (seventy percent) of the funds required for development, namely 2 billion. So the village government has an obligation to provide funds amounting to approximately 1 billion to business entities for the development and management of Sembilan Beach Tourism.

4. Commercial Risk

Commercial risks in Public Private Partnerships vary depending on what specific form of cooperation is adopted. Meanwhile, in the collaboration between the Lamongan regional government and PT Bunga Wangsa Sejati, the BOT pattern is used, where by using this pattern, the commercial risks that occur will be borne by the private sector. What is
meant by commercial risk in this research is all forms of risk that arise due to compelling circumstances.

5. Time Period

In the collaboration between the Bringsang village government and Mr. Sutlan, the time period for the collaboration is also regulated, including regarding the period for implementing development, and also the end of the Sembilan Beach Tourism management period which also includes provisions for handing over assets to the government at the end of the period. The collaboration between the Bringsang Village Government and Mr. Sutlan resulted in an agreement that the management period for the Pantai Sembilan Tourism Area was set at 20 (twenty) years from the completion of the construction of the Tourism Area and could be extended for a second management period of 20 (twenty) years. The management period is also included as the maintenance period for the Tourist Area and its supporting facilities. The obligations of the private sector, in this case Mr. Sutlan, during the specific development implementation period are to complete planning documents, which include:

a. Preparatory work includes measuring and preparing the soil.

b. Planning drawings, starting from site plans, architectural drawings, installation construction drawings and calculations and other equipment drawings.

c. Specifications and work plans as well as implementation schedules (time-schedule) and work implementation requirements.

d. Pictures of supporting infrastructure and facilities from the Maritime Tourism Area buildings.

The role that the public expects of the private sector (private sector/collaboration partners) in BOT

The emphasis on Partnership or Public Private Partnership is that this partnership will replace the government's role in providing services to the community, but this does not mean that the responsibility of the public sector is lost. The profit-oriented private sector, if not regulated by regulations from the public sector, will provide inappropriate services to the community or charge unreasonable prices. This is because the private sector will seek maximum profit as possible. Therefore, the government must remain responsible for ensuring adequate services that meet the needs of the community (Sjaifurrachman & Fithry, 2024a).

Technical expertise is knowledge and expertise in a particular field of specialization or expertise on how to do and produce something which consists of direction with motivation, supervision and communication. As previously explained, one of the reasons the Lamongan Regency Government collaborated was to calculate and consider Mr Sutlan's technical abilities. The reason is that he previously served as village head for 2 terms and has managed this ninth beach since he was still village head.
Meanwhile, the ability to manage this kind of facility for the village government is something very new. Apart from that, the village government has many weaknesses, one of which is human resource capacity. The human resources that the village government has in terms of managing tourism objects are very lacking. So, with this collaboration, it is hoped that, after the collaboration process ends, if the government does not get an extension from the private sector, it will have sufficient knowledge in management capabilities. This is because the village government not only wants to gain financial benefits from this collaboration, but the village government also wants to learn to manage tourism management.

1. **Operation Efficiency**

   The efficiency in question is providing services or services to the community without using more resources. The concept of efficiency here does not only refer to low operating costs but also from the customer's perspective the services obtained will provide benefits efficiently.

   The collaboration between the Lamongan Regency Government and PT Bunga Wangsa Sejati resulted in an extraordinary increase in PAD. This is influenced by improving the quality of service provided to the service targets. Improving quality will also affect the amount of annual income from the sector. As in the interview conducted with the Village Head on October 29 2023 at the Village Hall:

   "Thank God, with the nine beaches appearing in the APBDes, the village's original income, for 2020, will reach IDR. 25,000,000/year, which was initially only around five million, can now increase, because it is still in the development and maintenance stages."

2. **There is a large investment (invest: in bulk).**

   The collaboration that has been formed between the Village Government and Mr. Sutlan in developing the Sembilan Beach Tourism costs approximately Rp. 2 billion. The amount of investment funds for capital participation is the amount that must be invested directly for the development of the tourist area.

   With the agreed capital distribution, namely 55% from the private sector (CV Sejahtera Sejati) and 45% from the Bringsang Village Government, the need for capital participation funds is quite large, namely Rp. half a billion from the government, and the remaining Rp. 1.5 billion is from the private sector. It can be concluded that investors or the private sector in the cooperation to establish the Sembilan Beach Tourism spent quite a large amount of capital. So the government is not only building the Sembilan Beach Tourism itself, but the government is also attracting investment from the private sector with quite large funds brought by these investors.

3. **Indirect Investment**
In the collaboration between the Bringsang Village Government and the private sector, in this case Mr. Sutlan and the management and maintenance (Mantenance) are the responsibility of the private sector. In the sense of indirect investment, it means that the investment is invested. Indirectly or investments made within a certain period for management and maintenance. So the researcher's analysis of indirect investment will be limited to periodic investment (per year) where the funds are budgeted for development purposes (Wang et al., 2024).

Analyze the prerequisites needed to develop sustainable partnerships

In collaborating with the Public-Private Partnership concept, there are certain prerequisites that must be met to ensure success in developing sustainable partnerships. Several prerequisites will determine the stability and continuity of cooperation (Herlan et al., 2024). Collaboration or partnership between the public and the private sector in the establishment, development and management of Sembilan Beach Tourism involves various parties, not only investors and the village government, but also the BPD in determining the level of success of the collaboration.

1. Political Commitment

Political Commitment or the involvement of the BPD to provide a commitment to support the collaboration process is very important in every decision making, especially if the decision involves the expenditure of quite large funds. Every movement of the village head as an executive in terms of running the government cannot be separated from the supervision of the BPD. This means that the BPD in government has oversight functions over the wheels of government carried out by the executive, including the release of funds for capital participation in the development and management of Pantai Sembilan Tourism.

The government has a unique way of getting support from BPD. By considering the aspect of speed and taking advantage of existing opportunities, the government has put aside the decision-making procedures taken. This means that the Bringsang Village government negotiated development and management cooperation with Mr Sutlan without prior consultation with the BPD. The government considers that the opportunities that exist require quick and correct decision making.

2. Determination of Service Rates

In determining service rates, it is the right of the business entity as the management of Sembilan Beach Tourism. This is because they feel they understand the estimated size of expenditure and several other needs that will be used as a basis for determining rates. The fare to get to the ninth beach is by boat first to cross to the island. The boat fee per person is IDR 15,000,- and the entrance ticket to Sembilan Beach is charged IDR 15,000,-/person. Motorbike parking is IDR 10,000 and IDR 20,000 for car parking.

So determining tariffs is the private sector's sole right in managing Sembilan Beach Tourism. This is given because the government feels that the private sector knows more about specific calculations as considerations in determining tariffs.

3. Regulatory Framework
One of the prerequisites for public sector collaboration with the private sector is the existence of a regulatory framework, this means that there are clearly agreed provisions in the collaboration (Rao et al., 2024). This regulatory framework includes regulating the rights and obligations of each party in implementing the cooperation agreement. Thus, the regulatory framework is a requirement that cannot be ignored, because this concerns the rights and obligations of each party. The regulatory framework governing cooperation, duties, obligations and rights of each party in cooperation between the Government and the private sector in the establishment and management of Lamongan Marine Tourism is contained in a memorandum of understanding or Memorandum of Understanding (MoU).

4. Information

In cooperation on the development and management of the Sembilan Beach, there are two parties working together, but the two parties are not separate. Both parties work together and coordinate with each other to get maximum results. So in terms of openness of information on both sides, the Bringsang Village Government places one of its employees in the management of the tourism management business entity to be used as a supervisor and as a government representative if certain circumstances require policy in decision making by management. So the function of placing one of the government employees is to become a representative of the stockholders on the government side.

Openness to information or accountability by the management of Pantai Sembilan tourism is very high. The Bringsang Village Government can find out at any time and ask for accountability from the management of the nine beach management business entity regarding all information contained in management in a balanced manner. A balanced statement is intended so that performance claims are not always related to the positive achievements that have been achieved, but also openly state to the public the various failures and obstacles to efforts to achieve that performance (Liu-Lastres et al., 2024). And if possible, together with stakeholders, companies can eliminate various obstacles in their efforts to achieve adequate performance. Others, balance can be understood as an effort to publish reports to stakeholders widely and proportionally. Because performance reports are one of the fruits of public encouragement for openness in the performance of business entities, reports should not only be aimed at capital owners (shareholders). Business entity performance reports are also intended for other stakeholders.

Based on these models, it can be concluded that Public-Private Partnerships primarily provide benefits in the form of efficiency and effectiveness in providing quality public services. However, on the other hand, the role of the private sector in funding (investing) in service facilities does not eliminate the government's responsibility to formulate regulations that guarantee service standards and costs that remain affordable for all service users. The government sets basic rules to determine the Public-Private Partnership model that suits community needs. Government control is indeed reduced in a number of types of Public-Private Partnership, but in fact the government still plays an important role in ensuring the quality of services provided by the private sector. Therefore, responsibility and accountability remain in the hands of the government.
In this research, the analysis of the Public-Private Partnership model in collaboration with the Bringsang Village Government adheres to the BOT (Build-Operate-Transfer) model, but in its implementation there are several differences which researchers term as characteristics. This collaboration has the characteristics of a Public-Private Partnership model with the concept of "BOT (Build-Operate-Transfer) a la Pantai Sembilan". What researchers mean by BOT (Build-Operate-Transfer) in the style of Pantai Sembilan, as explained above, if depicted in tabular form, can be described as follows:

Tabel 4 Pantai Sembilan style BOT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model PPP</th>
<th>d - Operate – Transfer ( Kumar &amp; Prasad )</th>
<th>Build - Operate – Transfer ( Pantai Sembilan )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alat Analisis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kepemilikan Aset</td>
<td>Publik</td>
<td>Publik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operasi dan Manajemen</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investasi Modal</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Publik &amp; Swasta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resiko Komersial</td>
<td>Swasta</td>
<td>Publik &amp; Swasta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durasi</td>
<td>25-30 Tahun</td>
<td>20 Tahun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebutuhan akan keahlian teknis</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Ya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebutuhan akan keahlian Manajerial</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
<td>Ya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kebutuhan Efisiensi Operasi</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
<td>Ya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dana Penyertaan Modal Yang Besar</td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Sebagian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investasi: Tidak Langsung</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Komitmen Politik</td>
<td>Cukup</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarif Pelayanan</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerangka Peraturan</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informasi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
<td>Tinggi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above, it shows that there are differences between Kumar and Prasad's version of the BOT and the BOT that was carried out in the collaboration on the establishment and management of Sembilan Beach.

Conclusion

From the results of the research that has been carried out regarding the cooperation model for the establishment, development and management of Sembilan Beach, the following conclusions can be drawn:

1. The collaboration between the Bringsang Village Government and Mr. Sutlan as the main investor in the establishment, development and management of Sembilan Beach Tourism with the BOT (Build-Operate-Transfer) concept is not fully in accordance with the existing BOT concept. This is because there are several characteristics that Bringsang Village uses as advantages and uniqueness in making a breakthrough.
2. The differences between the Kumar Prasad BOT concept and the Pantai Sembilan BOT did not become an obstacle for both parties in carrying out cooperation. This actually becomes a privilege for both parties, as evidenced by this difference, in its implementation it turns out that both parties can work together well. It is said to be special because in this collaboration, the weaknesses of one party will be covered by the other party. So that both parties can synergize well in the construction, development and management of Sembilan Beach Tourism. For example, in terms of funds, because in terms of funding obligations, the government initially funded 70% of business capital needs, but now it becomes 45% because the government finds it difficult with the size of these funds.

3. The success of the Bringsang Village Government and Mr. Sutlan in collaborating on the development, development and management of Marine Tourism cannot be separated from the active role of both parties, with the principle of "picking up the ball". Investors will not hesitate to invest their capital in tourism, of course with the convenience offers provided.

Declaration of conflicting interest

This research was written purely to look at cooperation and management of the Sembilan Gili Genting beach tourism in Sumenep district using a public-private model analysis, without any conflict of interest when the research was carried out.

References


Analysis of Public – Private Partnership Model in Cooperation and Management of Semnilan Gili Beach Tourism, Genting, Sumenep District


Sutlan. (2023). Pantai Sembilan, Interview. October 18, 2023

